CICF Implementation Progression

EL Education K-8 Language Arts Curriculum

Updated September 2024

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership

COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK

EL Education

CURRICULUM OVERVIEW: EL Education K-8 Language Arts Curriculum

EL Education K-8 Language Arts Curriculum (EL Education) advances mastery of knowledge and skills, character, and high-quality student work to honor students' full humanity. When students and teachers are engaged in work that is challenging, adventurous, and meaningful, learning and achievement flourish. EL Education's mission is to create classrooms where teachers fulfill their highest aspirations, and students achieve more than they think possible, becoming active contributors to a better world.

USE GUIDANCE

This Implementation Progression, created in collaboration with EL Education, is for curriculum-specific coaching and continuous improvement. It gives leaders, coaches, teachers, and others a sense of what curriculum implementation looks like along a developmental progression. That progression is:

Refining Use	Progressing Use	Emerging Use	No Evidence of Use
Evidence observed suggests that the teacher is implementing the curriculum with integrity.	Evidence observed suggests that the teacher is approaching implementation of the curriculum as it was designed.	Evidence observed suggests that the teacher is in the early stages of implementing the curriculum as it was designed.	Evidence observed suggests that the teacher is not using the curriculum as designed.

The Implementation Progression can be used to set a shared vision for curriculum implementation, for self-reflection, for coaching, and/or for measuring teachers' progress toward high-quality implementation. It is not designed for accountability or assessment purposes.

CPRL Center for Public Research and Leadership

EL Education

OBSERVATION INSTRUCTIONS

Before the Observation

Observers should review both the summary and the full Implementation Progression, both below. Observers also should review the unit and lesson plans and familiarize themselves with the curriculum if they are not already.

Where possible, two observers should conduct each observation. It is helpful for one, if not both, of the observers have robust experience with the curriculum.

During the Observation

Ideally, observers will observe a full lesson. Observers should take notes about what they see during the observation.

The examples included in the Implementation Progression are designed as illustrative examples of the kinds of activities an observer might (or might not) see. They should not be used as a checklist or required criteria.

After the Observation

Following each observation, observers should review their evidence, determine where the instruction falls on the developmental progression for each Component of the Implementation Progression, and record their placement and rationale.

OBSERVATION FAQs

- **What if I can't decide between two columns on the Implementation Progression?** The goal is to determine whether the instruction has fully achieved the level of implementation in which it is being placed. As such, when the evidence suggests the instruction is between two levels, it should be placed in the earlier of the two levels.

- **What if I didn't see one of the Implementation Progression Components?** The Implementation Progression is designed based on the foundational instructional elements typically present in all EL Education lessons. Observers should be able to see all Components in a full lesson observation (and often, a partial lesson observation). However, if an observer is unable to collect evidence on a particular Component (because, for example, they had to leave early), no placement on the Progression should be provided (i.e., select N/A).

- **What if there is more than one teacher in the classroom?** One Implementation Progression should be completed for each teacher. If it is not clear which teacher to observe, the observer should choose the teacher that is most deeply interacting with the curriculum (or is expected to be).

SUMMARY IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESSION

	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
Component 1: Content-based Literacy (Mastery of Knowledge and Skills)			
1.A: 4Ts (Text, Topic, Tasks, Targets)			
To what extent do teachers engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module?	Teachers engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module.	Teachers somewhat engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module.	Teachers minimally engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module.
1.B: RTTW: Read, Think, Talk, Write			
To what extent do teachers have students synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication?	Teachers have students synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication.	Teachers have students somewhat synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication.	Teachers have students synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication in limited ways.
Component 2: Challenging, Engaging, Empowering Instruction (Mastery of Knowledge and Skills)			
2.A: Students Leading Learning			
To what extent do teachers support students in taking leadership over their learning?	Teachers support students in taking full leadership over their learning.	Teachers support students in taking some leadership over their learning.	Teachers support students in taking limited leadership over their learning.
2.B: Meeting Students' Needs			
To what extent do teachers provide students with individualized learning experiences?	Teachers provide students with individualized learning experiences.	Teachers provide students with somewhat individualized learning experiences.	Teachers provide students with largely uniform learning experiences.
2.C: High-Leverage Instructional Practices			
To what extent do teachers use high-leverage instructional practices that are well-matched to the lesson and student needs?	Teachers use many high-leverage instructional practices that are well-matched to the lesson and student needs.	Teachers use some high-leverage instructional practices that are somewhat well-matched to the lesson and student needs.	Teachers use instructional practices that are mostly supportive of teacher-led instruction.
Component 3: High-Quality Student Work			
3.A: Craftsmanship			
To what extent do teachers guide students through a deliberate creation process that results in accurate, detailed work?	Teachers guide students through a deliberate creation process that results in accurate, detailed work.	Teachers guide students through a somewhat deliberate creation process that results in somewhat accurate, detailed work.	Teachers guide students through a minimally deliberate creation process that results in largely inaccurate and/or undetailed work.
3.B: Complexity			
To what extent do teachers support students to demonstrate high-order thinking, analyze multiple perspectives, and transfer their learning within and across disciplines?	Teachers support students to demonstrate high-order thinking, analyze multiple perspectives, and transfer their learning within and across disciplines.	Teachers support students to demonstrate somewhat high-order thinking, analyze some perspectives, and partially transfer their learning within and across disciplines.	Teachers support students to demonstrate mostly low-order thinking, analyze a limited number of perspectives, and largely keep their learning within a single discipline.
3.C: Authenticity			
To what extent do teachers support students in using their original ideas and voice and connect their learning to the real world?	Teachers support students to use their original ideas and voice and consistently connect their learning to the real world.	Teachers support students to somewhat use their original ideas and voice and to occasionally connect their learning to the real world.	Teachers support students to use their original ideas and voice and connect their learning to the real world in limited ways.
Component 4: Character			
4.A. Learning Community			
To what extent do teachers lead a learning community where students have a strong sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose?	Teachers lead a learning community where students have a strong sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose.	Teachers lead a learning community where students have some sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose.	Teachers lead a learning community where students have a limited sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose.
4.B: Habits of Character			
To what extent are teachers leading a self-managed classroom where students practice habits of character?	Teachers lead a self-managed classroom where students consistently practice habits of character.	Teachers lead a somewhat self-managed classroom where students sporadically practice habits of character.	Teachers lead a classroom that is mostly teacher-managed where students practice habits of character in limited ways.

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership EL Education

Component 1	Content-based Literacy (Mastery of Knowledge and Skills)

1.A: 4Ts (Text, Topic, Tasks, Targets)

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module?	Teachers engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module.	Teachers somewhat engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module.	Teachers minimally engage students with texts that deepen their knowledge of the topic in alignment with the targets of the lesson, unit, and module.
	EXAMPLES	**EXAMPLES**	**EXAMPLES**
	Teachers make the text, topic, tasks, and targets highly visible to students. Teachers begin and end lessons by reviewing the EL Education learning targets. Teachers make the learning targets visible to students throughout the lesson, holding students accountable to long-term learning targets. Teachers use the module lesson text when engaging in reading, writing, listening, or speaking during literacy blocks.	**Teachers make the text, topic, tasks, and targets somewhat visible to students.** Teachers begin and end lessons by reviewing the EL Education learning targets but do not make them visible to students throughout the lesson (e.g., they are on a PowerPoint slide that goes away). Teachers reference the EL Education topic and text occasionally or in passing.	**Teachers do not make the text, topic, tasks, and targets visible to students.** Teachers share with students the EL Education task but not the targets, topic, or text, or teachers share the EL Education text and tasks, but not the topic or targets.
	Teachers use additional text that meets the complexity of the original. When teachers provide a "volume of reading" connected to student interests or to expose students to a variety of genres and purposes for reading, teachers use texts that meet the complexity of the originals and supplemental texts that vary in complexity.	**Teachers pull on additional text that inconsistently meets the complexity of the original.** When teachers provide "volume of reading" connected to student interests or to expose them to a variety of genres and purposes for reading, they use texts that are less complex than the EL Education originals both technically (e.g., word length, sentence structure) and qualitatively (e.g., purpose and meaning, knowledge demands, language).	**Teachers use texts that are less complex to students than the original.** Teachers replace EL Education texts with texts that are less complex both technically (e.g., word length, sentence structure) and qualitatively (e.g., purpose and meaning, knowledge demands, language) or use EL Education texts but simplify them for students.
	Teachers demonstrate fluency with the text, topic, tasks, and targets. Teachers facilitate EL Education lessons without significant reliance on the EL Education teacher guides. Teachers anticipate what's coming by addressing likely student misconceptions and pursuing opportunities to extend student learning.	**Teachers demonstrate some fluency with the text, topic, tasks, and targets.** Teachers facilitate EL Education lessons with some reliance on the EL Education teacher guides. Teachers inconsistently anticipate what's coming, sometimes being caught by surprise by student misconceptions and missing opportunities to extend student learning.	**Teachers demonstrate limited fluency with the text, topic, tasks, and targets.** Teachers facilitate lessons with significant reliance on the EL Education teacher guides. Teachers are learning the EL Education texts during their instruction, suggesting they have not thoroughly pre-read the texts.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation	☐ Emerging Implementation	☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed ☐ N/A

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership | EL Education

Content-based Literacy (Mastery of Knowledge and Skills)

1.B: RTTW: Read, Think, Talk, Write

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers have students synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication?	Teachers have students synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication.	Teachers have students somewhat synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication.	Teachers have students synthesize evidence, play with ideas, develop arguments, and rehearse various forms of communication in limited ways.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers use the full EL Education RTTW cycle.** Teachers leverage reading, thinking, writing, and talking within or across EL lessons to facilitate student processing, making connections, and engaging with the topic, text, and each other. Teachers consistently give students opportunities to engage in the RTTW cycle, maintaining the cycle's integrity even when adaptations are made.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers use parts of the RTTW cycle.** Teachers draw on the reading, thinking, writing, and talking portions of the RTTW cycle as they have time for, leaving off one of the elements or rushing through all four to get to them all.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers use reading, thinking, writing, and talking independently of the RTTW cycle.** Teachers have students read, think, talk, and write in isolation from each other, rather than as part of the RTTW cycle.
	Teachers use the EL Education text as the expert on the topic and weave in students' lived experiences as additional expertise. Teachers set a purpose for reading and provide time for students to read and think about the EL Education text. Teachers prompt students to find answers in the text. Teachers deepen students' understanding of content through text-based discourse with each other and by drawing on students' own lived experiences as an additional source of expertise to complement the text.	**Teachers and the text together are the experts on the topic.** Teachers sometimes prompt students to find answers in the EL Education text and facilitate student discussions. When students aren't getting the right answers or drawing on the right text, teachers might do it for them.	**Teachers position themselves as the expert on the topic.** Teachers lead class discussions and provide significant guidance to students. Teachers read, think, talk, and write aloud to show students what they are supposed to be doing and have students do their own reading, thinking, and writing mostly independently.
	Teachers use writing to help students crystallize their thinking and communicate their learning. Teachers utilize independent and shared note-taking, journaling, quick writes, and other formative writing activities in addition to summative writing tasks such as essays and narratives. Teachers consistently use reading, thinking, and talking to support students' writing and to support making meaning of what students have read.	**Teachers use writing to help students internalize their learning.** Teachers utilize summative writing tasks such as essays and narratives. Teachers sometimes use reading, thinking, and talking to support students' writing as a means of making meaning of what students have read.	**Teachers use writing to help students copy down information.** Teachers utilize writing tasks such as note-taking and short responses. Teachers have students practice their writing skills independent of making meaning of what students have read.

Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation	☐ Progressing Implementation	☐ Emerging Implementation	☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed	☐ N/A

Challenging, Engaging, Empowering Instruction (Mastery of Knowledge and Skills)

2.A: Students Leading Learning

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers support students in taking leadership over their learning?	Teachers support students in taking full leadership over their learning.	Teachers support students in taking some leadership over their learning.	Teachers support students in taking limited leadership over their learning.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers position students as experts.** Teachers prompt students to learn about the work of real professionals and to take on that work. Teachers use a variety of protocols to push conversations and thinking directly to students who choose and implement the protocols based on their purpose and preferences. **Teachers use data with students.** Teachers prompt students to set goals, have regular data conversations with students, ask questions and give feedback using data, provide opportunities for students to reflect on their own progress, and co-create learning plans with students so that students can describe what they know and can do, what they're working on, and their plan for getting there. **Teachers foster a culture of grappling.** Teachers support students in making meaning on their own or with their peers as they explore EL Education guiding questions and big ideas through text and other media. Teachers provide ample wait time and create space for students to take a break or "phone a friend" and then come back to the task. Teachers model their own thinking about challenges, especially where students also are likely to grapple. Teachers allow for multiple ways of processing information (auditory, visual, etc.). **Teachers publicly celebrate learning.** Teachers post student work, invite others to see and hear about student work, celebrate progress and milestones, and use student work as exemplars.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers somewhat position students as experts.** Teachers prompt students to learn about the work of real professionals, though stop short of having students take on that work. Teachers use some protocols that begin to transfer conversations and thinking to students, but carry the cognitive load by choosing which protocols to use and carrying the conversation through making connections between students' ideas. **Teachers make data available to students and use it to inform their own work.** Teachers give students their data so students can set goals or track their progress, in addition to using that data to inform their own planning. **Teachers support students in getting to the right answers.** Teachers keep asking a question until students find the right answer. Teachers use pacing as a key driver of their decision making. **Teachers privately celebrate learning.** Teachers provide positive reinforcement to students and acknowledge progress and milestones, especially during one-on-one meetings.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers position themselves as the experts.** Teachers select tasks that teachers think will be engaging. Teachers call on individual students to answer questions and then respond (creating a "ping pong"). Teachers use discussion protocols inconsistently, often leaving them out of the lesson. **Teachers use data to inform their work.** Teachers use formative data (e.g., module assessments, entrance/exit tickets) to set student learning goals for students and develop plans for how students will get there; teachers use that data to inform their planning. **Teachers prioritize getting students to the right answer.** Teachers act as the learning experts in the classroom and tell students the correct answer when there is confusion. **Teachers privately track student learning.** Teachers monitor task completion and mastery of skills in a gradebook. Teachers use exemplars that come from sources other than students.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation	☐ Emerging Implementation	☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed ☐ N/A

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership   EL Education

Challenging, Engaging, Empowering Instruction (Mastery of Knowledge and Skills)

2.B: Meeting Students' Needs

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers provide students with individualized learning experiences?	Teachers provide students with individualized learning experiences.	Teachers provide students with somewhat individualized learning experiences.	Teachers provide students with largely uniform learning experiences.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers support all students to reach the rigor of the grade-level lesson at a pace well-matched to the EL guidance and illustrated student need.** Teachers scaffold in ways that are appropriate to the expectations of the task. Teachers meet individual student needs (e.g., teachers give sentence frames to students who need additional support, but not to students who do not). Teachers differentiate text strategically (e.g., teachers use an easier text temporarily for students who are not yet ready to use the text called for; not all students receive that easier text, and it is not a permanent substitute, but rather, used for the shortest time necessary). **Teachers leverage ongoing assessments to continually refine their approach.** Teachers utilize flexible heterogeneous and homogeneous groups informed by multiple and ongoing assessments. Teachers continually refine those groups based on demonstrated need.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers support individual students to reach the rigor of the grade-level lesson, following the pace suggested by EL regardless of illustrated student need.** Teachers use a handful of scaffolds to support individual students in meeting grade-level standards. Teachers use scaffolds in a blanket way for all students rather than targeting specific students and specific needs. **Teachers leverage assessments to refine their approach.** Teachers utilize groups informed by assessment to meet student needs; the groups are changed based on assessments that occur quarterly, once a semester, or at some other regular cadence.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers adjust the rigor and pacing of the lesson based on what they think students can do.** Teachers use a few scaffolds with all students for all instruction (e.g., sentence starters were helpful for a few students, so teachers use them for all students and in most lessons). Teachers use a less complex text for all students and ensure the group stays together as they make their way through the text. **Teachers leverage assessments to grade students.** Teachers use assessments to rank student performance, for purposes of completing report cards, or to hold students accountable for work completion. Teachers do not use assessments when grouping students, instead grouping students based on assumed levels of need, behavioral considerations, or randomly.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation	☐ Emerging Implementation	☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed ☐ N/A

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership   EL Education

Challenging, Engaging, Empowering Instruction (Mastery of Knowledge and Skills)

2.C: High-Leverage Instructional Practices

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers use high-leverage instructional practices that are well-matched to the lesson and student needs?	Teachers use many high-leverage instructional practices that are well-matched to the lesson and student needs.	Teachers use some high-leverage instructional practices that are somewhat well-matched to the lesson and student needs.	Teachers use instructional practices that are mostly supportive of teacher-led instruction.
	EXAMPLES	**EXAMPLES**	**EXAMPLES**
	Teachers make students owners of the EL Education learning targets. Teachers prompt students to unpack, use, and revisit EL Education learning targets over the course of each lesson (including in exit tickets and closing activities).	**Teachers make students key inputs of the EL Education learning targets.** Teachers prompt students to go over the EL Education learning targets once at the beginning of each lesson.	**Teachers own the EL Education learning targets.** Teachers have students focus on the tasks they are given, independent of the EL Education learning targets.
	Teachers use varied, strategic mechanisms for student participation. Teachers leverage multiple protocols, presenting a menu of options appropriate to purpose and task that students can implement with few cues from teachers. Teachers co-create anchor charts by live-scribing, use strategic, varied total participation techniques that demand student attention based on what students need in the moment, and promote student-driven discourse that is aligned to the 4Ts and require students to build on the ideas of others.	**Teachers use multiple mechanisms for student participation.** Teachers use multiple protocols that provide time for review of and practice with protocols, and prompt students as needed as they move toward independence. Teachers create anchor charts in advance but leave spaces where students can contribute to them in real-time during lessons, and use participation techniques based on what was planned in advance rather than based on what students need in the moment.	**Teachers use a consistent set of techniques for student participation.** Teachers leverage the same protocol most of the time and guide students through it with significant support, write out anchor charts in advance and reveal to students during lessons, and prioritize opportunities for students to respond to teacher questions rather than talking to each other.
	Teachers ask questions as an intentional instructional technique. Teachers ask questions that are varied and specific to the learning targets, that clarify or confirm learning, that vary in the complexity of thinking they require, that are precise, that demand answers that call on specific evidence, that attend to concepts/ideas, structures, and specific details, and that are sequenced to build over time, maximizing use of EL Education's guides.	**Teachers ask questions by following EL Education's guides.** Teachers ask questions in an effort to follow EL Education's guides and without deeply-considered intentionality based on student need at the moment.	**Teachers ask questions as an engagement technique.** Teachers ask questions to make sure that students are paying attention and call upon a limited number of students that are likely to provide the right answers.
	Teachers check for understanding using approaches included in EL Education and adapt based on what students need. Teachers use multiple checks for understanding (e.g., exit tickets, interim confidence level checks) included in EL Education and smoothly make changes in real-time based on what they see and hear about where students are.	**Teachers check for understanding using approaches included in EL Education.** Teachers use suggestions included in EL Education on checks for understanding and sometimes adapt based on what they hear or do so consistently but with a choppiness in the flow of the lesson.	**Teachers check for understanding using self-developed approaches.** Teachers develop their own checks for understanding and use them ad hoc over the course of the lesson, often continuing apace regardless of what they learn.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation	☐ Emerging Implementation ☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed	☐ N/A

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership

EL Education

High-Quality Student Work

3.A: Craftsmanship

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers guide students through a deliberate creation process that results in accurate, detailed work?	Teachers guide students through a deliberate creation process that results in accurate, detailed work.	Teachers guide students through a somewhat deliberate creation process that results in somewhat accurate, detailed work.	Teachers guide students through a minimally deliberate creation process that results in largely inaccurate and/or undetailed work.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers guide a process of planning, drafting, refining, and publishing work.** Teachers provide multiple rounds of feedback to students and prompt students to provide multiple rounds of feedback to each other, lead students through multiple drafts where they are incorporating feedback so the work gets better over time, and provide feedback that addresses multiple dimensions of writing. **Teachers make work product expectations explicit.** Teachers walk students through exemplars and unpack relevant rubrics with students.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers prompt students to plan, draft, refine, and publish their finished work.** Teachers have students go through the motions of a drafting process, provide some feedback and ask students to make some revisions, and focus their revisions on particular dimensions of writing (e.g., structure but not voice). **Teachers make work product expectations somewhat explicit.** Teachers provide exemplars and relevant rubrics to students.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers support students in finishing their work.** Teachers prioritize final products over processes. Teachers make revisions to student drafts themselves for the sake of the final product. **Teachers keep work product expectations mostly implicit.** Teachers compare students' work product to others they've received and grade work based on their experience.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation ☐ Emerging Implementation ☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed ☐ N/A		

∞ CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership   EL Education

High-Quality Student Work

3.B: Complexity

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers support students to demonstrate high-order thinking, analyze multiple perspectives, and transfer their learning within and across disciplines?	Teachers support students to demonstrate high-order thinking, analyze multiple perspectives, and transfer their learning within and across disciplines.	Teachers support students to demonstrate somewhat high-order thinking, analyze some perspectives, and partially transfer their learning within and across disciplines.	Teachers support students to demonstrate mostly low-order thinking, analyze a limited number of perspectives, and largely keep their learning within a single discipline.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers model and communicate that students can reach and exceed grade level targets.** Teachers model summarizing, analyzing, and evaluating as the grade level requires. Teachers push students to consider and address varied perspectives in their thinking and work. Teachers advance students' facility to make connections between and within EL Education and other topics, classes, and texts. Teachers name and unpack what grade level expectations are (e.g., using EL Education exemplars and rubrics), and use those from a grade-level above when they want to show where students are heading. **Teachers help students apply their learning to academic and non-academic settings.** Teachers prompt students to make connections between what they're learning in class and what is happening in the real world, both nationally and locally, and provide students with opportunities to apply what they've learned to take action or pursue interests in their personal lives and in other classes.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers support students in reaching grade level targets.** Teachers expect and support students to summarize, analyze, and evaluate as the grade level requires by using EL Education module texts and media alongside the read-think-talk-write cycle and scaffolding included within lessons. **Teachers help students apply their learning to academic settings.** Teachers prompt students to make explicit connections between what they're learning in class and what is happening in other tasks and in other classes.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers support students in repeating what they learn.** Teachers prompt students to memorize and repeat back what they have learned. Teachers provide their views on various discrete topics covered in class. Teachers prioritize recall and knowledge-level comprehension with module texts with some components of the read-think-talk-write cycle. **Teachers help students show what they have learned.** Teachers ask students to complete assignments and tasks and support them in doing so.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation ☐ Emerging Implementation ☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed ☐ N/A		

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership   EL Education

High-Quality Student Work

3.C: Authenticity

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers support students in using their original ideas and voice and connect their learning to the real world?	Teachers support students to use their original ideas and voice and consistently connect their learning to the real world.	Teachers support students to somewhat use their original ideas and voice and to occasionally connect their learning to the real world.	Teachers support students to use their original ideas and voice and connect their learning to the real world in limited ways.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers prompt students to use their original ideas and voice to develop meaningful work, in alignment with the relevant rubric.** Teachers support students to synthesize their learnings and own ideas about the content covered and invite students to express their own ideas in their own words to create something special, unique, and that has value for students and/or the real world. **Teachers prompt students to make wide-reaching connections.** Teachers provide opportunities to create and share work for audiences that go beyond the school (e.g., a book review for a newspaper). Teachers supplement the EL Education materials to make meaningful connections between the materials and the lived experiences and local contexts of students (e.g., bringing in speakers from the community on the topics as they are covered).	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers prompt students to use their original ideas and voice to achieve what is provided for in the relevant rubric.** Teachers support students to synthesize their learnings and own ideas about the content covered and invite students to express their own ideas in their own words for purposes of achieving something similar to the exemplary models provided. **Teachers prompt students to make connections to other academic contexts.** Teachers provide opportunities to create and share work for audiences across the school and leverage EL Education materials in ways that help make meaningful connections between the materials and the lived experiences of students.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers prompt students to follow exemplars.** Teachers support students to copy and adapt what is contained in the lesson materials or exemplary models. Teachers invite students to use the language contained in exemplary models. **Teachers prompt students to complete academic tasks.** Teachers invite students to create work products following specific content and process parameters designed by teachers and assess quality based on those teacher-designed parameters (e.g., a book report for a teacher).
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation ☐ Emerging Implementation ☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed ☐ N/A		

Component	Character
4	**4.A. Learning Community**

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent do teachers lead a learning community where students have a strong sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose?	Teachers lead a learning community where students have a strong sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose.	Teachers lead a learning community where students have some sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose.	Teachers lead a learning community where students have a limited sense of identity, belonging, agency, and purpose.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers help students feel seen.** Teachers use well- established EL Education structures and practices to promote collaborative community and foster belonging (e.g., teacher modeling, Conversation Cues, circles, classroom norms or agreements) and use them to build relationships. Teachers welcome students at the classroom entrance, call students by their correct names, get to know things about their interests and loved ones, and regularly communicate with their families.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers manage student behavior but are working to help students feel seen, too.** Teachers start to implement EL Education structures and practices designed to promote collaborative community and foster belonging (e.g., teacher modeling, Conversation Cues, circles, classroom norms, or agreements), but teachers emphasize the technical aspects of that implementation.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers tightly manage student behavior.** Teachers organize much of their class time around independent work, maintain professional distance and formality in their interactions with students (limiting conversation topics to academics), and have students leave their interests and families for outside class hours.
	Teachers build classroom cultures that honor students' strengths. Teachers use greetings, appreciations, and apologies to cultivate respect and care, ground instruction and support in what students know and are able to do and create physical environments that support collaboration (e.g., students sit at tables, there's a whole group learning space, evidence of the text, task, target, and topic are clearly evident in what's on the walls such as student work, co-created anchor charts, and other examples of student learning).	**Teachers build classroom cultures that acknowledge student potential.** Teachers sometimes use greetings, appreciations, and apologies, acknowledge that students already know and are able to do things, and create physical environments that support some collaboration (e.g., desks are easily moved in and out of groups or students sit at tables, and evidence of the text, task, target, and topic are sometimes evident).	**Teachers build classroom cultures that focus on what students currently do not know or cannot do.** Teachers separate students by ability, provide grade-level work only to students who they think are ready, prioritize direct instruction where teachers are doing the talking and students are listening, and spend a lot of time on remediation.
	Teachers empower students to design their own learning environments. Teachers co-construct and collectively revisit with students class expectations and norms, check in about how students are feeling about the class periodically, and ask for suggestions on ways to make it better.	**Teachers seek input from students.** Teachers prompt students to provide ideas for class expectations and norms and share how they are feeling about the class once in a while. Teachers give students options from which they can choose.	**Teachers maintain total control over learning.** Teachers convey clear expectations and norms and revisit as they see fit. Teachers tell students which tasks to do when and how to do them. Teachers elicit feedback from colleagues or school leadership (not students) about the class.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation	☐ Progressing Implementation	☐ Emerging Implementation	☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed	☐ N/A

∞ CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership   EL Education

PROGRESSION	Refining Implementation	Progressing Implementation	Emerging Implementation
To what extent are teachers leading a self-managed classroom where students practice habits of character?	Teachers lead a self-managed classroom where students consistently practice habits of character.	Teachers lead a somewhat self-managed classroom where students sporadically practice habits of character.	Teachers lead a classroom that is minimally self-managed and where students practice habits of character in limited ways.
	EXAMPLES **Teachers foster collaboration.** Teachers have students work with a wide variety of peers, provide feedback that is kind, specific, and helpful, model and provide students with opportunities to practice treating their peers well, building on others' perspectives, and standing up for what is right.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers support students as they practice collaborating.** Teachers give students opportunities to work with their peers in limited, controlled ways.	**EXAMPLES** **Teachers prioritize independent academic work.** Teachers support students in working independently, teachers provide students with unidirectional feedback on their academic work and students receive that feedback, and emphasize the final product rather than the process undertaken to get there.
	Teachers promote self-managed classrooms. Teachers explicitly lead and model respectful interactions with students and colleagues, set norms for respectful communication and enforce those norms without compromise, and protect and honor cultural differences in the classroom. Teachers help students learn about their own social and academic strengths, contribute to the class in significant and varied ways, and shift through multiple configurations of learning and mixing up silent independent work with discussion, problem-solving, critique, and creation as the work demands. Teachers prompt students to share their ideas and understanding with different groups, analyze and critique each other's ideas, and take leadership roles in classroom discussions and protocols. Teachers model and prompt students to make mistakes, speak up in class, ask questions, pose ideas, and try out new concepts and vocabulary.	**Teachers shift some control over their classroom to students.** Teachers provide protocols and procedures that allow students to do much of the talking and feel like they are leading the classroom, but continue to maintain significant control over enforcing the rules and procedures of the classroom.	**Teachers tightly manage their classrooms.** Teachers do much of the talking and provide directions to students about what to do when (and how) and create and enforce rules and procedures in the classroom.
	Teachers leverage the habits of character EL Education materials. Teachers co-create with students rubrics around the habits of character and reference those rubrics during lessons and in materials, utilize lesson materials to explicitly highlight character components and provide students with experiences that build on those components, unpack the habits of character in a developmentally- appropriate progression, and celebrate with students how their habits of character are growing with practice.	**Teachers use portions of the habits of character EL Education materials.** Teachers focus on habits of character at the start and end of lessons, but not during content-heavy portions, mention habits of character in passing as they work on getting through the content of the lesson, and make quick note of students who are growing their habits of character through practice.	**Teachers use only academic portions of EL Education materials.** Teachers skip over the habits of character rubric co-creation and do not reference the habits in their lessons or materials, take for granted that students' ability is growing with their effort, and focus only on students' academic performance.
Progression Placement & Notes	☐ Refining Implementation ☐ Progressing Implementation	☐ Emerging Implementation	☐ No Evidence of Use of Curriculum as Designed ☐ N/A

CPRL | Center for Public Research and Leadership   EL Education

For more information, visit CPRL's website at cprl.columbia.edu
or contact Elizabeth Chu (emc2170@columbia.edu) or Molly Gurny (mg4034@columbia.edu).